Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER July 11, 2013



State Gym at Iowa State University; Image Special Collections Department, ISU Library

◆□▶ ◆◎▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ● □

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction Estimation

Results

Motivation

- There is an increasing body of evidence that poor health as a child has lasting impacts on educational and labor market outcomes
- A portion of this relationship is driven by biology, with poor infant and childhood health being correlated with adult health complications
- However, there is also an economic channel: poor childhood health changes the relative prices faced by parents when investing in children
- Raises the possibility that even healthy children will have their outcomes affected by unhealthy siblings

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction Estimation Results

Brief overview of paper

- I create a new dataset linking adult health and educational attainment to childhood household characteristics
- I estimate the effects of having a sibling in utero during the pandemic on educational and health outcomes
- Results suggest that parents shifted resources to older children when a child received a negative health shock
- The effects are large and suggest health shocks or interventions can dramatically alter the relative outcomes of siblings

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction Estimation Results

・ロト・西ト・ヨト・ヨー うへの

Childhood Health and Adult Outcomes

- There is a growing body of empirical evidence linking childhood health to adult socioeconomic and health outcomes
- One strand of the literature looks at health differences between twins or siblings to control for household fixed effects
- Another strand focuses on shocks to childhood health that target specific birth cohorts
- The studies generally find that poor health in early childhood is associated with poor economic and health outcomes as an adult

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction Estimation Results

Childhood Health and Adult Outcomes

Possible mechanisms for the link between childhood health and adult outcomes:

- Direct effect of poor childhood health on school attendance and productivity
- Poor health hindering cognitive development
- In utero health affecting metabolism leading to later chronic health issues
- Parents altering investment decisions based on children's health

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Childhood Health and Adult Outcomes

Parents altering investment decisions implies sibling outcomes may be affected:

- Becker and Tomes framework predicts increased investment in less healthy child if health shock affects endowment but not price of increasing child quality
- Investment will reinforce sibling inequality if health shock leads to higher price of increasing child quality
- More recent models (Behrman et al., Ejrnæs & Pörtner, Adhvaryu & Nyshadham) incorporate aversion to inequality in outcomes across children

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction Estimation Results Conclusions

The Influenza Pandemic of 1918



Credit: Office of the Public Health Service Historian (image at www.flu.gov)

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introductior

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction Estimation

Conclusions

・ロト ・ 日・ ・ 田・ ・ 日・ ・ 日・

The Timing of the Pandemic



Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introductior

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction Estimation

Results

Conclusions

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆ 臣▶ ◆ 臣▶ 臣 - のへぐ

The Timing of the Pandemic



Deaths per 1,000 people by month, 1918-1919

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introductior

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction Estimation Results Conclusions

The Distribution of Flu Deaths



Deaths from influenza or pneumonia per 100,000 people by age group

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introductior

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction Estimation

Conclusions

・ロト ・ 日 ・ ・ ヨ ・ ・ ヨ ・ うへぐ

The Distribution of Flu Deaths



1980 male disability rate, Figure 7 from Almond (2006)

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲ 臣▶ ▲ 臣▶ ▲ 臣 → のへの

Childhood Health.

Sibling Outcomes

Placing the Pandemic in Context



 GDP per capita and total fertility rate by country for 2010 and by decade for the US

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲三▶ ▲三▶ 三 のへの

Childhood Health.

Sibling Outcomes

Placing the Pandemic in Context



Infant mortality rates and life expectancy by country for 2010 and by decade for the $\ensuremath{\mathsf{US}}$

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introductior

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction Estimation

Conclusions

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□ ● ● ●

Placing the Pandemic in Context



Literacy rates and enrollment rates by country for 2010 and by decade for the $\ensuremath{\mathsf{US}}$

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introductior

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction Estimation

Results

Conclusions

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲三▶ ▲三▶ 三 のへの

The Influenza Pandemic of 1918 as a Natural Experiment

- It arrived rapidly and unexpectedly, families weren't making decisions in anticipation of the pandemic
- It was a massive health shock striking a quarter of the population and killing over 600,000 Americans but was short lived
- The flu had particularly severe effects for pregnant women that led to poor health outcomes for children in utero during the pandemic
- US fertility, health and education measures at the time of the pandemic are comparable to those of modern developing countries

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction Estimation Results

Potential Data Sources

- The basic idea is to look at how adult outcomes depend on having a sibling affected by the influenza pandemic
- This requires person-level data with adult outcomes (ideally income, occupation, education, health) that also have info on siblings
- Almond uses modern 1960/1970/1980 census data, Almond & Mazumder use SIPP data but these lack sibling info
- Historical census data allows for observing siblings but not adult outcomes
- Solution: combine childhood information from historical censuses with adult outcome data from military records

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Constructing the Dataset

- Individuals are sampled from World War II enlistment records
- These individuals are then matched to the 1930 federal census on the basis of name, birth year, and birth state
- If a match is found in the 1930 federal census, information on the individual's siblings and parents is recorded
- Resulting variables for successfully linked individuals include:
 - Enlistment records: height, weight, educational attainment, civilian occupation,...
 - Census records: siblings ages and genders, parents' occupations, house value, household location,...

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Matching Enlistees to the Census

Field Title	Value	Meaning
ARMY SERIAL NUMBER	35548336	35548336
NAME	PARMAN#ROBERT#F##	PARMAN#ROBERT#F##
RESIDENCE: STATE	53	OHIO
RESIDENCE: COUNTY	123	OTTAWA
PLACE OF ENLISTMENT	5384	TOLEDO OHIO
DATE OF ENLISTMENT DAY	23	23
DATE OF ENLISTMENT MONTH	2	2
DATE OF ENLISTMENT YEAR	43	43
GRADE: ALPHA DESIGNATION	PVT#	Private
GRADE: CODE	8	Private
BRANCH: ALPHA DESIGNATION	BI#	Branch Immaterial - Warrant Officers, USA
BRANCH: CODE	0	Branch Immaterial - Warrant Officers, USA
FIELD USE AS DESIRED	#	#
TERM OF ENLISTMENT	5	Enlistment for the duration of the War or other emergency, plus six months, subject to the discretion of the President or otherwise according to law
LONGEVITY	###	###
SOURCE OF ARMY PERSONNEL	0	Civil Life
NATIVITY	53	OHIO
YEAR OF BIRTH	24	24
RACE AND CITIZENSHIP	1	White, citizen
EDUCATION	4	4 years of high school
CIVILIAN OCCUPATION	677	Semiskilled filers, grinders, buffers, and polishers (metal)
MARITAL STATUS	6	Single, without dependents
COMPONENT OF THE ARMY	7	Selectees (Enlisted Men)
CARD NUMBER	#	#
BOX NUMBER	957	957
FILM REEL NUMBER	5.19#	5.19#

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Conclusions

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲三▶ ▲三▶ 三三 のへで

Matching Enlistees to the Census

Matches 1-7	7 of 7 Sorted By	Relevance					
View Record	Name	Parent or spouse names	Home in 1930 (City, County, State)	Birth Year	Birthplace	Relation to Head of House	View Image
<u>View</u> <u>Record</u> ★★★★	Robert F Parman	Hannon, Luella A	Washington, Sandusky, Ohio	abt 1924	Ohio	Son	
<u>View</u> <u>Record</u> ★★★	Robert Parman	Omer, Martha	Nashville, Davidson, Tennessee	abt 1923	Tennessee	Son	b
<u>View</u> Record ★★★	Robert L Parman	James J, Amy K	Washington, Harrison, Missouri	abt 1923	Missouri	Son	
<u>View</u> <u>Record</u> ★★★	Robert Parson [Robert Parman]	B L, Jennie	Melrose, Grundy, Iowa	abt 1926	Iowa	Son	\$
<u>View</u> Record ★★★★★	Robert R Parman	Elmer, Alma	Allen, Worth, Missouri	abt 1927	Missouri	Son	•
<u>View</u> <u>Record</u> ★★★	Robert Carman [Robert Parman]	Claude, Edna	Brighton, Adams, Colorado	abt 1929	Iowa	Son	
<u>View</u> Record ★★★	Robert R Parman	Porter, Addie L	New Hampton, Harrison, Missouri	abt 1930	Missouri	Son	

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Conclusions

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ □臣 = のへで

Obtaining Information for Matched Enlistees

anaty .	w other all county	durchy Warhington Street	664	Wald of -	illy avenued pain				foca M		FIFTEENT	POPULATIO	N SCHEDUL	E	ES: 1	500 d by mm	. May 19	Superviser's Dist.	CHIA	pair	2	17.1
PLACE		ENEL	1 5	80	NE DATA	T	TODONG DOE	artics G		-	PLACE OF MIXTE		MITTER TOPOLE AR	MIS	0.00		ocern		-	CHES-LEN	PP 10	805
1	100 00	d'aut press then also al shade an	Balamon a	2 4	6	24	1 1.	1 4. 11	1 :1	The office of each pe		or her parents. Where is	LUNCLICE OF FOREIG	1008	6.1	. 15	-	-		1000	희금	207
		President and the second	Ant	1 1	1	Я,	1	19		Final Contents of the	inglish, and blast Place Ball	the Arthus Indeed	1000		罰	16	Bistorian	Jan Martin	薑	1 2	1 2	2
							4 4				·			• 0	-							
11	2.7 114	alate Cattern E	Aught	*		14	116	4 H	4.20	alin	aler	Ellis	.19	_		100	here				-	
-		- A LAN	Stanighter .			칏쏞	-2 14		- 22	000	and a	and -		-		- 20	Road -		-	-		
	1.1	- Julaila, E	Un de	-		żΓ	110	3 6	16.	Chia	and	Ola		-		Page 1	Knud				-	+
	449 448	Schnider Clance	seile.	k l	141	14.00	1 134	4 10 14	die.	dil.	ali	ali				- 60	transe	Sen towner	NW o	24	14	1
-	K L	- Kery	wit 11		-11	XX	Q 27	14 20 14	elju	di	alis	Chai	9			- h-	Kent	1		2	-	_
		Benland	Sec. 10			14	# 14	1 2	s free	100	all the	Ser.	1			- 100	deve				-	-
	11/11/	Part Mund	Inch I	14	-++	à là	19 21	4 49 4	1.	74.	0	and	1	-		- 10	France	Sec. Com	mit		10	-
	1	- I fuelly it	W.GN		1.6	87	4 12	4/12/2	6 14	Cha	aline	Oki	8			5.	Hours	1		1	12	-
	1	- Jane f.	Ser			XĤ	14	5 16	0	ahi	Chini	Chi				-	Kont					
-	111 331	- Hurry H.	21011	<u>8</u>	- 181	1. 14	10 520	61 20 8	فتربله	94.2	Alexand	Serman	59	15 0		Les.	frances	Antaring	MWV 10	25	150	- 0
-		these a	10.01			3 C	100	9 10 2	e file	La de	- Service y	Bernaty	19	110		194	Kone	1	1100	-	-	-
	370 417	Schwide Soing C.	dev 1	6	10	1. 10	10 66	44.58	1.	CC:	Sec. 4	The second	4	A 6		- Č.	Januar Con	A. ton	141/2		10	- 14
		- adella	W.L. H		- 9	X 7	47. 64	4x 17 4	46	Ohia	Chil	Chil	59	1		- K.	Here .	1		P.	T	-
-	124 833	Troff Churles 4	merel	0	18	34-12	63 63	44 2	14	Ches -	Suman	Sermany		10		K.	James	Sen Farry	$M \sim 2$	Ye.	14	27
-		- inglia in	Wit H			1 4	\$ 56	41 V1 K	• Geo	and the	Marcaly.	Chill	.59	81		140	Home	×	-	1		-
		nice have by	- Marylen		-++	ΧĽ	2 10	C 12	17	Linen.	Gunge	All's				- 200	Xend		-		+ +	-
		- Bettie He	Sec. 16	14.		217	1/23	5 30	1	100	121	Chi:	1.0	+		- 22	Hour		-			+
	111/11	Egic Frank.	mil	6	5 8	e 40	41 61	14 21 A.	1 20	alin	Sentredont	aline	59	11		C	Theward	Harmereras	127 10	Kes 2.9	1 24	
		4- Caroline M	Big H		-++	Y Z	w 13	× 23 40	1	Clinia	Scorgiang	Berny	52	00		34	Here	-	- 1			
-	1000	Ro. ander	Section 4	0 -		100	10 10	1 18	-р-	Ulan .	and	Chart	59	-		- 5	Morrise	200	21.4.			-
-	10000	a me to and a	Sec. 1	10 40	~ **	58	6 12	2 2 2 A	10	No. C.	- fillin	allie	21	14 0		- 61	Perguene	Profilence Change	in the	see	140	-
	247 53	Schward Chartin H	head	A 15		6	10 36	4 21 4	Bee	alli	Cherry	Official	59	1		10	Laborer .	Stat Hill	871 4	40	1/4	-
		Sindie 11	WileH			47	4 34	4.13 5	. I	Indiana	Andrana	ali				See.	diara			1		
-		- Acres to	Aright	1	-++	¥ 7	~ 6	5 10	1	Office	Que	Fridiana	5	-		-	Here	244.77	-		-	-
		Wall de to to	10. 2.		-++	310	0.75	2 10	0	1 adres	o latera	margana	57	-		- 10	Steres	Cald love	6540 2	14 3	6	-
	una	Pasenen Hashing	Decad		-11	10	10 80		T.	Ola	Profiling .	ale.	0			- č.	220.01	2 8 4	1879 6	Xa	- 14	48
		- Sucha a	Oh H	2	18	XE	10 14	4 11 15	Ч.,	alis	Of	Ohis	55			Nee	Selone).	Chen Chin	1	Bel.	de	-
		- Jerry G	Sine			X 83	41 23	3 6	- 14	- Chi	Ohie	Chis	9			100	Here	41	4	1		
H	+	mond f.	Serec.		-11	XK	1 11 14	1 2	a fra	- Chin	Chis	- qui	55	-		194	Have		-+-		+	+
		Klaning L	A. 31.		-++	文문	4 1	5 6	- 11-	12	all	110	51	-		12	Read		-	-		+
		- Earl 10	Sele			XM	~ 10	3 6	16	alia	14.	als	51			Ta	lout					-
		- aleque C	Ser			XK	200 9	5		alis	This	Okie	31			5	line					
H	-	- april 1	Sers			14	60 6	10	syn.	04	dis	Chai	57			- 94	Hore		-		-	-
	11000	Sunda Stades	1 de	41	. 10	ХŔ	142 12		1.	- Ste	20.	900	19			free	Heart 1	2 01	ALXI .		14	-
	T. He	- Klaulto	10 den	rt ·	- 13	12	41 92	213		Ohis	100	72	37			2	Carperte.	concertaine	uni la	175	114	+
F	100	Herentin Milling	road	0	a	24.04	10 61	42.10	16.	Ohis	OL:	China	59			E.	Historman	The Star Che	130	de.	14	- 60
1	+ + -	- Mayrille	Wark	L F	_	XY	10 37	10 20 10	160	alie	Olin	Ching	59			64	Here.		- T	V	1	-
H	+	ille space	Promptele	11		¥₹.	14 26	\$ 12 10	з¥°	Ching .	Ofija	alin		-		- fee	Here		-		-	-
F	++-	Rudes Solar W	Contra la	++-		ŶĽ	100 14	31 8	114	1 20	China	94	9	-		14	Kone	-	-		+	+
		- Sull Levy	and a			XH	~ 6	5 80		al.	- Chin	Chi	1			-6	Kent		-		1	
E	-	- Jean ad	Cardly			XF	~ 1	5 1 17	1	aller	Ohn	Chi	.9			4	Here					

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introductior

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Conclusions

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲ 三▶ ▲ 三▶ - 三 - のへで

The Resulting Sample

Summary statistics by census match status					
	Matched to federal census	Not matched to federal census			
Number of individuals	13, 173	14,139			
Year of birth	1918.8	1918.7			
	(3.2)	(3.2)			
Year of enlistment	1941.8	1941.8			
	(0.8)	(0.9)			
Height	68.4	68.3			
	(2.7)	(2.8)			
Weight	150.2	149.9			
	(21.3)	(21.7)			
Body mass index	22.5	22.5			
	(2.9)	(3.0)			
Years of secondary and post-	3.0	2.8			
secondary schooling	(2.2)	(2.3)			
Percentage who are white	94.4%	90.1%			
Percentage who migrated to a different state	13.5%	25.0%			
Percentage who are sons of the household head	90.1%				

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Conclusions

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲ 臣▶ ▲ 臣▶ 三臣 - のへ⊙

The Resulting Sample



・ロト ・ 日 ・ ・ 日 ・ ・ 日 ・ ・ 日

Childhood Health. Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Dataset construction

Estimation Strategy

Given the adult outcomes from the enlistment records and the childhood household data from the census, estimation of the effect of the pandemic is fairly straightforward:

 $Y_{i,j} = f(X_i, Z_j, Flu_j, \varepsilon_{i,j})$

- Y_{i,j}: adult outcome of interest (educational attainment, height, weight, BMI)
- X_i: individual characteristics (age, race, birth order, birth order among brothers, state of birth)
- Z_j: household characteristics (family size, parents' income, spacing and gender of siblings, house value, state of residence)
- *Flu_j*: indicator for sibling in utero during influenza pandemic

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Estimation Strategy

The functional form will depend on the outcome of interest:

 $Y_{i,j} = f(X_i, Z_j, Flu_j, \varepsilon_{i,j})$

- Tobit model for years of education (over 20 percent of enlistees have zero years of secondary schooling)
- Logit models for binary education variables (attended HS, graduated HS)
- Linear models for health outcomes (height, weight, BMI)

・ロット (雪) ・ (日) ・ (日) ・ (日)

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Identifying Treated Siblings

- The estimation strategy is based on identifying siblings in utero during the pandemic
- The severe months of the pandemic were October, November and December of 1918
- The birth cohorts in utero during the pandemic were therefore born in late 1918 and the first half of 1919
- Complicating things is the way age is reported in the federal census
- From the enumerator instructions:

[Age at last birthday] calls for the age in completed years at last birthday. Remember, however, that the age question, like all other questions on the schedule, relates to April 1, 1930. Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Identifying Treated Siblings



Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Identifying Treated Siblings



Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Summary Statistics for Regression Sample

Family characteristics of enlistees in regression sample Standard Variable Mean deviation Number of people in household 6.4 2.3 2.2 Number of siblings 3.0 Number of brothers 16 15 Number of older siblings 1.5 1.6 Number of older brothers 0.8 1.1 Percentage with an older sibling born in 1919 8.2% Percentage with a younger sibling born in 1919 6.9% Percentage with an older brother born in 1919 4.1% Percentage with a younger brother born in 1919 3.4%

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Childhood Health.

Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Conclusions

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲ 臣▶ ▲ 臣▶ ▲ 臣 → のへの

Outcomes of the Influenza Birth Cohort

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Conclusions

	Results from Almond (2006) Results u							
Outcome	1960 Census	1970 Census	1980 Census	enlistee records				
High school graduate	-0.021***	-0.020***	-0.014***	-0.028***				
	(0.005)	(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.001)				
Years of education	-0.150***	-0.176***	-0.117***	-0.132***				
	(0.038)	(0.023)	(0.019)	(0.002)				
Never attended high school				0.017***				
				(0.001)				
Height				-0.035***				
				(0.007)				
Weight				-0.371***				
				(0.040)				
Body Mass Index				-0.034***				
				(0.006)				
Observations	114,031	308,785	471,803	2,744,642				

Departure of 1919 male birth cohort outcomes from 1912-22 trend

Results are the coefficient on an indicator for being in the influenza cohort included a linear regression controlling for birth year and birth year squared. Robust standard errors are given in parentheses. * significant at 10%, ** significant at 5%, *** significant at 1%

・ロト・白マ・山下・ 山下・ シック

Tobit regression results, years of secondary and post-secondary education as dependent variable

Sibling measure:	<u>All si</u>	<u>olings</u>	Brothe	rs only
Includes individuals born in 1919:	no	yes	no	yes
Has older sibling born in 1919 (1=yes)	-0.038	-0.072	-0.145	-0.167
	(0.116)	(0.117)	(0.153)	(0.148)
Has younger sibling born in 1919 (1=yes)	0.267**	0.244**	0.244*	0.227*
	(0.113)	(0.109)	(0.142)	(0.134)
Number of older siblings	-0.172***	-0.169***	-0.196***	-0.196***
-	(0.021)	(0.019)	(0.031)	(0.029)
Number of younger siblings	-0.359***	-0.352***	-0.426***	-0.422***
	(0.020)	(0.017)	(0.034)	(0.030)
Household head's log income	1.665***	1.627***	1.756***	1.719***
	(0.117)	(0.111)	(0.119)	(0.113)
Observations	8,743	9,865	8,743	9,865

Robust standard errors clustered by birth state in parentheses. Regressions include controls for race, state fixed effects, presence of the father and a cubic in age. * significant at 10%; ** significant at 5%; *** significant at 1% Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Logit regression results, high school attendance or graduation as dependent variable

Dependent variable:	Attended h	high school	Graduated	<u>high school</u>
Includes individuals born in 1919:	no	yes	no	yes
Has older sibling born in 1919 (1=yes)	-0.026	-0.053	-0.122	-0.148
	(0.100)	(0.102)	(0.105)	(0.105)
Has younger sibling born in 1919 (1=yes)	0.355***	0.333***	0.233***	0.223***
	(0.104)	(0.101)	(0.085)	(0.084)
Number of older siblings	-0.124***	-0.123***	-0.131***	-0.123***
	(0.018)	(0.017)	(0.021)	(0.018)
Number of younger siblings	-0.240***	-0.234***	-0.265***	-0.263***
	(0.016)	(0.015)	(0.019)	(0.017)
Household head's log income	1.393***	1.372***	1.007***	0.990***
-	(0.079)	(0.078)	(0.086)	(0.082)
Observations	8,743	9,865	8,743	9,865

Robust standard errors clustered by birth state in parentheses. Regressions include controls for race, state fixed effects, presence of the father and a cubic in age. * significant at 10%; ** significant at 5%; *** significant at 1% Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Dependent variable:	Attended high school	Graduated high school				
Mean of dependent variable:	0.792	0.524				
Has older sibling born in 1919	-0.005	-0.030				
	(0.018)	(0.026)				
Has younger sibling born in 1919	0.056	0.058				
	(0.015)	(0.021)				
Number of older siblings	-0.021	-0.032				
	(0.003)	(0.005)				
Number of younger siblings	-0.042	-0.065				
	(0.003)	(0.005)				
Household head's log income	0.241	0.249				
	(0.013)	(0.021)				

Marginal effects (dP(y=1)/dx) of siblings on educational outcomes based on logit regressions

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Conclusions

OLS estimates of sibling health on own adult health outcomes

Dependent variable:	Height	Weight	Body mass index
Includes individuals born in 1919:	no	no	no
Has older sibling born in 1919 (1=yes)	0.055	0.497	0.068
	(0.110)	(0.568)	(0.096)
Has younger sibling born in 1919 (1=yes)	0.081	0.182	-0.026
	(0.089)	(0.613)	(0.093)
Number of older siblings	-0.073***	-0.473***	-0.021
	(0.028)	(0.138)	(0.017)
Number of younger siblings	-0.129***	-0.756***	-0.019
	(0.025)	(0.103)	(0.018)
Household head's log income	0.192*	0.983	0.021
	(0.103)	(0.832)	(0.113)
Observations	8,743	8,624	8,624

Robust standard errors clustered by birth state in parentheses. Regressions include controls for race, state fixed effects, presence of the father and a cubic in age. * significant at 10%; ** significant at 5%; *** significant at 1%

- The results suggest strong effects of having a younger sibling born during the pandemic
- However, there is the possiblity that this sibling variable is a proxy for something else related to family structure and the enlistee's birth year
- Two approaches will help alleviate concerns:
 - Rerun everything with the inclusion of birth cohort dummies to more flexibly control for cohort trends
 - Rerun analysis using placebo influenza cohorts by assuming influenza pandemic was earlier or later

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Influenza birth year defined as: 1919 1917 1921 Includes individuals born in flu cohort: no no no Has older sibling born in flu cohort (1=yes) -0.038 0.001 -0.139(0.116)(0.102)(0.174)Has younger sibling born in flu cohort (1=yes) 0.267** -0.061 -0.035 (0.156) (0.113)(0.087)-0.172*** -0.173*** -0.171*** Number of older siblings (0.021) (0.017)(0.020)-0.359*** -0.345*** -0.344*** Number of vounger siblings (0.020)(0.018)(0.021)Household head's log income 1.665*** 1.617*** 1.626*** (0.117)(0.116)(0.111)

Robust standard errors clustered by birth state in parentheses. Regressions include controls for race, state fixed effects, presence of father and a cubic in age, * significant at 10%: ** significant at 5%: *** significant at 1%

Tobit sibling coefficients for placebo influenza cohorts

Childhood Health. Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Results

dependent variable)							
Influenza birth year defined as:	1919	1917	1921				
Includes individuals born in flu cohort:	no	no	no				
Has older sibling born in flu cohort (1=yes)	-0.026	0.008	-0.224				
	(0.100)	(0.093)	(0.170)				
Has younger sibling born in flu cohort (1=yes)	0.355***	-0.022	-0.043				
	(0.104)	(0.119)	(0.078)				
Number of older siblings	-0.124***	-0.127***	-0.120***				
	(0.018)	(0.016)	(0.019)				
Number of younger siblings	-0.240***	-0.223***	-0.216***				
	(0.016)	(0.016)	(0.014)				
Household head's log income	1.393***	1.380***	1.344***				
	(0.079)	(0.083)	(0.088)				

Logit sibling coefficients for placebo influenza cohorts (attended high school as

Robust standard errors clustered by birth state in parentheses. Regressions include controls for race, state fixed effects, presence of father and a cubic in age. * significant at 10%; ** significant at 5%; *** significant at 1% Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introductior

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Influenza birth year defined as:	1919	1917	1921				
Includes individuals born in flu cohort:	no	no	no				
Has older sibling born in flu cohort (1=yes)	-0.122	-0.030	-0.161				
	(0.105)	(0.084)	(0.114)				
Has younger sibling born in flu cohort (1=yes)	0.233***	-0.106	-0.041				
	(0.085)	(0.096)	(0.062)				
Number of older siblings	-0.131***	-0.128***	-0.116***				
	(0.021)	(0.016)	(0.017)				
Number of younger siblings	-0.265***	-0.258***	-0.252***				
	(0.019)	(0.017)	(0.017)				
Household head's log income	1.007***	0.978***	0.979***				
	(0.086)	(0.087)	(0.081)				

Logit sibling coefficients for placebo influenza cohorts (graduated high school as dependent variable)

Robust standard errors clustered by birth state in parentheses. Regressions include controls for race, state fixed effects, presence of father and a cubic in age. * significant at 10%; ** significant at 5%; *** significant at 1%

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introductior

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction

Estimation

Results

Conclusions, Future Work

- The sibling data reveal significant reallocation of resources within families with a major health shock
- Results also suggest that effects on older siblings are quite different than effects on subsequent siblings
- These impacts are big: the gain in education from having a sick sibling is similar in magnitude to the gain associated with a 20 percent increase in parental income
- Several future directions for the work:
 - Household resource allocation models that can account for observed patterns
 - Implications for intergenerational mobility
 - Make use of the 1940 federal census (income, occupations, educational attainment for all siblings; ability to include females in regressions)

Childhood Health, Sibling Outcomes and the 1918 Influenza Pandemic

John Parman College of William & Mary and NBER

Introduction

Childhood health and adult outcomes

The Pandemic of 1918

Dataset construction Estimation Results Conclusions